# UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

THE STATE OF NEW YORK AND PETER M. IWANOWICZ, AS ACTING COMMISSIONER OF THE NEW YORK STATE DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL CONSERVATION,

Plaintiffs.

v.

**CIVIL NO. 11-CV-0293 (KMK)** 

TOWN OF CLARKSTOWN, NEW YORK; ALLIED WASTE NORTH AMERICA, INC. FOR ITSELF AND ITS SUBSIDIARIES, INCLUDING, WITHOUT LIMITATION, AMERICAN DISPOSAL SERVICES OF NEW JERSEY, INC. AND BFI WASTE SYSTEMS OF NEW JERSEY, INC., AND INSOFAR AS IT AND ITS SUBSIDIARIES ARE ALLEGED TO BE A SUCCESSOR TO VINCENT IPPOLITO, INC. AND ROUND LAKE **SANITATION CORP.: AMERTAC:** AVERY DENNISON CORP.; BARR LABORATORIES, INC.; BECTON DICKINSON AND COMPANY: BOROUGH OF RINGWOOD, NEW JERSEY; CHROMALLOY NEW YORK, DIV. OF CHROMALLOY GAS TURBINE CORP.; CLARKSTOWN CENTRAL SCHOOL DISTRICT; CONSOLIDATED RAIL CORP.; COSCO INDUSTRIES INC.; COUNTY ASPHALT, INC.; COUNTY OF ROCKLAND HIGHWAY DEPT.; **EVONIK DEGUSSA CORPORATION AS** SUCCESSOR TO DYNAMIT NOBEL OF AMERICA; FISHER SCIENTIFIC CO.: FORD MOTOR CO.; GANNETT SATELLITE INFORMATION NETWORK, INC., D/B/A THE JOURNAL **NEWS; HOLT CONSTRUCTION CORP.:** INNOVATIVE PLASTICS CORP.: INTERNATIONAL PAPER CO.; J. FLETCHER CREAMER & SON, INC.; MARTIN MARIETTA MATERIALS, INC.; METAL IMPROVEMENT CO., LLC

	USDS SDNY	
	DOCUMENT	
	ELECTRONICALLY FI	LED
1	DOC #:	
	DATE FILED:	

(F/K/A METAL IMPROVEMENT CO., INC.); MOMENTIVE SPECIALTY CHEMICALS, INC. (F/K/A BORDEN CHEMICAL, INC.); NANUET UNION FREE SCHOOL DISTRICT; NESTLE WATERS NORTH AMERICA INC.; **NOVARTIS CORP.; NYACK HOSPITAL;** NYACK UNION FREE SCHOOL DISTRICT; ORANGE AND ROCKLAND UTILITIES, INC.; PEARL RIVER SCHOOL DISTRICT; PLASTI-CLAD METAL PRODUCTS, INC.; PEARSON EDUCATION, INC. (F/K/A PRENTICE HALL, INC.); PFIZER INC. FOR ITSELF AND ITS SUBSIDIARIES INCLUDING, WITHOUT LIMITATION, WYETH HOLDINGS CORPORATION ACTING THROUGH WYETH PHARMACEUTICALS (LEDERLE LABORATORIES); PULSAFEEDER, INC.; RAMAPO CENTRAL SCHOOL DISTRICT; ROCKLAND COUNTY **SEWER DISTRICT NO. 1; SANITARY** WASTE CARRIERS, INC.; SEARS. ROEBUCK AND CO.; SOUTH ORANGETOWN CENTRAL SCHOOL **DISTRICT; SUBURBAN CARTING** CORP.; THALLE CONSTRUCTION CO.; TOWN OF GREENBURGH, NEW YORK; TOWN OF ORANGETOWN, NEW YORK; UNEEDA ENTERPRIZES, INC.; UNITED WATER NEW JERSEY INC.; UNITED WATER NEW YORK INC.: VALE INCO AMERICAS INC.; VERIZON NEW YORK INC.; VILLAGE OF ARDSLEY, NEW YORK; VILLAGE OF DOBBS FERRY, NEW YORK; VILLAGE OF ELMSFORD, NEW YORK; VILLAGE OF HASTINGS-ON-HUDSON, NEW YORK; VILLAGE OF IRVINGTON, NEW YORK; VOLKSWAGEN GROUP OF AMERICA, INC.; WASTE MANAGEMENT OF NEW YORK, LLC AND MARANGI BROS., INC.; AND WIKOFF COLOR CORP.,

#### Defendants.

# CONSENT DECREE

Plaintiffs State of New York and Peter M. Iwanowicz, as Acting Commissioner of the New York State Department of Environmental Conservation ("NYSDEC") and as Trustee of the State's natural resources (collectively referred to as the "State"), the Town of Clarkstown, New York ("Town"), and Settling Defendants (as hereinafter defined) hereby agree as follows:

WHEREAS, the State alleges that the Defendants listed in Appendices A and B or their predecessors (hereinafter "Settling Defendants" as defined more fully in Paragraph 2 of this Decree) either arranged for the disposal of hazardous substances at, or transported hazardous substances to the Clarkstown Landfill ("Site") located in the Hamlet of West Nyack in the Town of Clarkstown, County of Rockland, State of New York (the State, the Town, and the Settling Defendants shall be referred to as the "Parties");

WHEREAS, the Settling Defendants do not admit or deny the State's allegations;

WHEREAS, the Town operated a municipal landfill on the Site from the 1950s to December 31, 1990, and allegedly received a combination of municipal solid waste, commercial waste and industrial waste at the Site;

WHEREAS, pursuant to Environmental Conservation Law ("ECL") § 27-1305, the Site is listed in the New York State Registry of Inactive Hazardous Waste Disposal Sites under Site Code No. 3440001;

WHEREAS, the Town and NYSDEC entered into a Consent Order that required the Town to undertake the remedial actions required by the Record of Decision ("ROD") for the Site:

WHEREAS, NYSDEC and the Town entered into a State Assistance Contract (No. C300058) pursuant to the Environmental Quality Bond Act of 1986, whereby the State agreed to reimburse the Town for 75% of the eligible costs for investigation, remedial design, and

construction of the remedial action and construction oversight to be incurred by the Town at the Site;

WHEREAS, NYSDEC has made reimbursements to the Town pursuant to such agreement in an amount in excess of \$20 million and the State alleges that it has incurred other response costs, including interest and enforcement costs at the Site;

WHEREAS, the Town implemented response measures at the Site to remedy the alleged release and/or threatened release of hazardous substances into the environment, and incurred response costs, including, but not limited to, costs of investigation, removal, remedial activity, and operation and maintenance, as those terms are defined or used in Sections 101(23), 101(24), 101(25), 107(a) and 113 of the Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation and Liability Act ("CERCLA"), 42 U.S.C. §§ 9601(23), 9601(24), 9601(25), 9607(a) and 9613, in relation to the Site;

WHEREAS, the Town alleges that it has incurred costs for response measures that have not been reimbursed by the State;

WHEREAS, the Clarkstown Landfill Joint Defense Group ("Clarkstown Landfill JDG"), consisting of Settling Defendants Barr Laboratories, Inc.; Becton Dickinson and Company; Allied Waste North America, Inc. for itself and its subsidiaries, including, without limitation, American Disposal Services of New Jersey, Inc. and BFI Waste Systems of New Jersey, Inc., and insofar as it and its subsidiaries are alleged to be a successor to Vincent Ippolito, Inc. and Round Lake Sanitation Corp.; Chromalloy New York, Division of Chromalloy Gas Turbine Corporation; Clarkstown Central School District; Consolidated Rail Corporation; County Asphalt, Inc.; Evonik Degussa Corporation as successor to Dynamit Nobel of America; Fisher Scientific Company L.L.C.; Ford Motor Company; International Paper Company; Gannett

Satellite Information Network, Inc., d/b/a The Journal News; Metal Improvement Company, LLC (formerly known as Metal Improvement Company, Inc.); Momentive Specialty Chemicals, Inc. (f/k/a Borden Chemical, Inc.); Nyack Hospital; Orange and Rockland Utilities, Inc.; Pearson Education, Inc. (f/k/a Prentice Hall, Inc.); Pfizer Inc. for itself and its subsidiaries including, without limitation, Wyeth Holdings Corporation acting through Wyeth Pharmaceuticals (Lederle Laboratories); Rockland County Sewer District No. 1; County of Rockland Highway Department; Sanitary Waste Carriers, Inc.; Suburban Carting Corp.; Town of Orangetown, New York; United Water New York Inc.; United Water New Jersey Inc.; Waste Management of New York, LLC and Marangi Bros., Inc.; and Wikoff Color Corporation, have entered into separate agreements among themselves and all other Settling Defendants for the payment of Site response costs and other consideration;

WHEREAS, the State has commenced this action in the United States District Court for the Southern District of New York to settle claims for response costs at the Site;

WHEREAS, the Settling Defendants wish to resolve, and the State and Town agree to release all Settling Defendants from, any liability under CERCLA, the ECL, and common law for the response costs at the Site and for any and all liability relating to the Site, subject to the conditions set forth below, and the State and Town wish to resolve, and the Settling Defendants agree to release the State and Town from, any liability under CERCLA, the ECL, and common law for response costs at the Site and for any and all liability relating to the Site, subject to the conditions set forth below.

WHEREAS, the Parties have agreed to the provisions of the Consent Decree ("Decree");

NOW, THEREFORE, IT IS ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED THAT:

#### **JURISDICTION**

1. This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter and the Parties to this action pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1331, and 42 U.S.C. § 9613(b).

#### PARTIES BOUND

This Decree shall apply to and be binding upon the State, the Town, and each of the Settling Defendants, their affiliates, subsidiaries, related entities, predecessors, successors and assigns, and any other entities under common control with Settling Defendants within the meaning of Rule 405 of the Securities Act of 1933, as amended, or their past, present and future employees, officers and directors (all hereinafter "Settling Defendants"). Each signatory to this Decree represents that she or he is fully authorized to enter into the terms and conditions of this Decree and to bind the party represented by her or him. Any change in governance, ownership or corporate status of a Settling Defendant including, but not limited to, any transfer of assets or real or personal property, shall in no way alter such Settling Defendant's rights or responsibilities under this Decree.

#### NO ADMISSION OR ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

3. Neither this Decree, nor any terms hereof, nor the entry into this Decree, nor performance of the terms hereof by any of the Settling Defendants or the Town shall constitute or be construed as an admission, acknowledgment or denial by any of the Settling Defendants or the Town of the factual or legal assertions contained in the Complaint or this Decree, and the Settling Defendants and the Town retain the right to controvert in any subsequent proceedings, other than proceedings for the purpose of implementing or enforcing this Decree, the validity of the facts, allegations or determinations contained in this Decree. Neither this Decree, nor any terms hereof, nor the entry into this Decree, nor performance of the terms hereof by any of the Settling Defendants or the Town shall constitute or be construed as an admission, acknowledgment or

denial by any of the Settling Defendants or the Town of any liability, responsibility or fault with respect to the conditions at or arising from past or future conditions, activities or operations at the Site, or as an admission of violation of any law, by any Settling Defendant or the Town. Settling Defendants agree not to take any action or to make or permit to be made any public statement contradicting this Decree or any of its provisions. Nothing in this paragraph affects Settling Defendants': (a) testimonial obligations; or (b) right to take legal or factual positions in litigation or other legal proceedings to which the Attorney General is not a party.

## **PAYMENTS**

4. Within sixty (60) business days of the date on which the State sends the Settling Defendants notice of the Effective Date of this Decree (as provided in Paragraph 14 of this Decree) (the "First Payment Date"), the Clarkstown Landfill JDG (on behalf of its individual members and all other Settling Defendants at that point in time) shall remit to the State the amount of \$1,500,000 in accordance with Paragraph 15 of this Decree. Within one (1) calendar year of the First Payment Date, the Clarkstown Landfill JDG (on behalf of its individual members and all other Settling Defendants at that point in time) shall remit to the State the amount of \$1,250,000, in accordance with Paragraph 15 of this Decree. Within two (2) calendar years of the First Payment Date, the Clarkstown Landfill JDG (on behalf of its individual members and all other Settling Defendants at that point in time) shall remit to the State the amount of \$1,250,000, in accordance with Paragraph 15 of this Decree. The total of these three payments (\$4,000,000) shall constitute the total monetary contribution to be made by the Settling Defendants in full settlement of this matter.

#### **COVENANT NOT TO SUE**

5. Subject to the Reopener provision in Paragraph 8 and the Reservation of Rights

provision in Paragraph 9 of this Decree, the State and the Town covenant not to sue, execute judgment, or take any civil, judicial or administrative action under any federal, state, local or common law (other than an action to enforce this Decree) against each of the Clarkstown Landfill JDG members and of the Settling Defendants that makes its required payment to the Clarkstown Landfill JDG, for any matter arising out of or relating to the Matters Addressed by this Decree (as specified in Paragraph 9 of this Decree), including, without limitation, any claims or causes of action for costs, damages, enforcement costs, interest, contribution or attorneys' fees. This Covenant Not to Sue takes effect as to all Settling Defendants upon the Effective Date of the Decree. This Covenant Not to Sue shall not preclude an action by the State against the Clarkstown Landfill JDG to the extent that payments required to be made pursuant to Paragraph 4 of this Consent Decree are not timely made by the Clarkstown Landfill JDG.

6. Each Settling Defendant agrees not to assert any claims or causes of action under any federal, state, local or common law against the State, or its employees, agencies or departments, or against the Town, or its employees, agencies, or departments, or against any other Settling Defendant or to seek against the State or the Town or other Settling Defendants, or any of them, any costs, damages, contribution or attorneys' fees arising out of any Matters Addressed by this Decree (as specified in Paragraph 9 of this Decree); provided, however, that if the State, pursuant to the Reopener provision in Paragraph 8 of this Decree, asserts a claim or commences or continues a cause of action against a Settling Defendant with respect to the Site, other than to enforce the obligations contained in this Decree, this Paragraph 6 shall not preclude the assertion by such Settling Defendant of any claims, counterclaims, defenses, or other causes of action against the State or the Town or any other Settling Defendant, but only to the same extent and for the same matters, transactions, or occurrences as are raised in the claims or causes of action of the

State or the Town or any other Settling Defendant. Notwithstanding the foregoing, any Settling Defendant may assert any claims or causes of action against any person other than the State, the Town or another Settling Defendant, to the extent permitted by law, for any costs, damages, contribution or attorneys' fees, arising out of any Matters Addressed by this Decree (as specified in Paragraph 9 of this Decree). For purposes of this Consent Decree, the definition of "State" does not include the various State of New York entities, departments or counties who contributed waste materials to the Site and have not settled with the State or the Clarkstown Landfill JDG. Likewise, for purposes of this Consent Decree, the definition of "Town" does not include the various villages, hamlets or other municipal entities located within the Town of Clarkstown who contributed waste materials to the Site, and have not settled with the State or the Clarkstown Who Landfill JDG. Nothing in this Decree shall affect the rights or defenses available to any Settling Defendant pursuant to any contract or indemnification agreement with respect to the Site.

7. In consideration of the payments made by the Town for the investigation and remediation of the Site, and subject to the Reopener provision in Paragraph 8 and the Reservation of Rights in Paragraph 9 of this Decree, the State releases and covenants not to sue, execute judgment, or take any civil, judicial or administrative action under any provision of federal or state statutory or common law (other than an action to enforce this Decree) against the Town for any matter arising out of or relating to the Matters Addressed by this Decree (as specified in Paragraph 9 of this Decree), and the Town covenants not to sue, or take any civil, judicial or administrative action under any federal or state law (other than enforcement of this Decree) against the State or its employees, agencies or departments for any matter arising out of or relating to the Matters Addressed by this Decree; provided, however, that if the State, pursuant to the Reopener provision in Paragraph 8 of this Decree, asserts a claim or commences or continues

a cause of action against the Town with respect to the Site, this Paragraph 7 shall not preclude the assertion by the Town of any claims, counterclaims, or other causes of action against the State or Settling Defendants, but only to the same extent and for the same matters, transactions or occurrences as are raised in the claims or causes of action of the State or a Settling Defendant.

# REOPENER

- Notwithstanding any other provision of this Decree, the State reserves, and this 8. Decree is without prejudice to, the right to institute proceedings, or to issue an administrative order seeking to compel the Town and/or the Settling Defendants listed in Appendix A hereto: (a) to perform further response actions relating to the Site, or (b) to reimburse the State for additional costs of response, but in either case only if:
  - (i) conditions at the Site previously unknown to the State are discovered after the Effective Date, or
  - (ii) information, in whole or in part previously unknown to the State, is received after the Effective Date,

and these previously unknown conditions or information, together with any other relevant information, indicates that the response measures selected for the Site are not protective of human health or the environment. For purposes of this Reopener, previously known conditions at the Site and previously known information include all conditions and information known to the State as of the Effective Date including, but not limited to, all conditions identified and information contained or submitted for inclusion in the Administrative Record for the Site, or in the files and records of NYSDEC or the Town. The Town and the Settling Defendants listed in Appendix A hereto reserve all their rights, claims and defenses to liability in proceedings or other actions instituted or arising under or pursuant to this Paragraph 8. This Reopener does not apply to any of the Settling Defendants listed in Appendix B hereto.

# MATTERS ADDRESSED AND RESERVATION OF RIGHTS

- 9. Except as specifically reserved in Paragraphs 8 and 12 of this Decree, the State, pursuant to its authority under Sections 104 and 107 of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. §§ 9604 and 9607, the ECL and common law, is resolving against Settling Defendants and the Town, and the Settling Defendants and the Town are resolving against each other and against the State (a) any and all claims, including but not limited to federal claims under CERCLA, and state claims under the ECL and common law, for response costs, past and/or future, that have been incurred and/or will be incurred for the investigation and remediation of the Site, no matter when or by whom incurred, including any and all response costs incurred by any party to this action, (b) any and all claims for any natural resource damages at or associated with the Site, and (c) any and all other claims or causes of action under any federal, state, local or common law relating to the disposal or alleged disposal of waste materials, including hazardous substances, or any alleged contamination relating to the disposal or alleged disposal of waste materials, including hazardous substances, at the Site (which claims collectively are referred to as "Matters Addressed").
- Defendants represent a fair and reasonable contribution by Settling Defendants and all other viable entities, other than the Town, who generated and/or transported waste disposed of at the Site (whether they are now Settling Defendants or will become Settling Defendants in the future pursuant to Paragraph 17 of this Decree) toward the total response costs that have been incurred by the State and the Town, and the total future response costs of the State and the Town that are anticipated, for the implementation of the remedial program set forth in the ROD for the Site including operation and maintenance, and monitoring response costs and all oversight costs.

Settling Defendants reserve the right to assert claims for contribution against parties other than the State and the Town or their employees, under Sections 107, 113(f)(1) and 113(f)(3) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. §§ 9607, 9613(f)(1) and 9613(0(3), to the extent provided by law, as well as under state or common law.

- 11. The payments that already have been made by the Town, together with the reduction of the State's claim to reflect the share of liability potentially allocated to the Town, represent a fair and reasonable contribution by the Town toward the total past response costs that have been incurred by the State and the Town, and the total future response costs of the State and the Town that are anticipated for the implementation of the remedial program set forth in the ROD for the Site, including operation and maintenance and monitoring response costs.
- 12. Matters Addressed do not include, and the State reserves all of its rights with regard to, the State's right to bring any action or proceeding against any person, firm, corporation, or other entity other than Settling Defendants and the Town.

## **CONTRIBUTION PROTECTION**

Defendants and the Town, and its Boards, commissioners, executive directors and elected officials, have resolved their liability, including but not limited to liability under CERCLA, to the State and are entitled to the full extent of protection from contribution actions or claims as provided by Section 113(f)(2) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9613(f)(2), and/or any other applicable federal or state law, for the Matters Addressed by this Decree (as specified in Paragraph 9 of this Decree). Once entered, the Parties further agree, and by entering this Decree the Court finds, that this Decree shall constitute a judicially approved settlement for purposes of Section 113(f)(3)(B) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9613(f)(3)(B), and that the Settling Defendants are entitled to seek cost

recovery and/or contribution under Sections 107 and/or 113 of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. §§ 9607 and/or 9613, to the extent provided by law, as well as under state or common law, from any person except those who are entitled to contribution protection under Section 113(f)(2) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9613(f)(2).

## **EFFECTIVE DATE**

14. The Effective Date of this Decree shall be the date upon which the Decree is entered by the Court. The State shall send notice of the Effective Date to the Settling Defendants by electronic mail as provided in Paragraph 18 of this Decree. All times for performance of activities under this Decree shall be calculated from that date.

## MISCELLANEOUS PROVISIONS

15. All payments required to be made pursuant to Paragraph 4 of this Decree shall be made by wire transfer, or by certified or cashier's check(s) payable to the "State of New York" and delivered to:

Todd D. Ommen Assistant Attorney General New York State Department of Law Environment Protection Bureau 120 Broadway – 26th Floor New York, NY 10271

Any payments and all correspondence related to this Decree must reference CD #10-109.

- 16. Nothing in this Decree shall inure to the benefit of any other person or entity not a party to this Decree, except as expressly provided herein.
- 17. This Decree may not be modified except by express written agreement of all the Parties and approval by the Court. After judicial entry of this Decree, the Clarkstown Landfill JDG may enter into future settlements and seek to add additional Settling Defendants as signatories to either Appendix A or B. If the State agrees to add such additional Settling

Defendants as signatories to this Decree, the State, the Clarkstown Landfill JDG and the additional Settling Defendant(s) shall formalize the addition of such Settling Defendant(s) through an appropriate joint motion filed with the Court.

18. Any notification to the Settling Defendants shall be in writing or by electronic mail and shall be deemed properly given on receipt thereof if sent to the following, or to such other person as Settling Defendants may designate by written notice to the State:

Irv Freilich Gibbons P.C. One Gateway Center Newark, NJ 07102 ifreilich@gibbonslaw.com Telephone No.: (973) 596-4735

and

Gary Justis, Esq.
Wagstaff & Cartmell LLP
4740 Grand Avenue, Suite 300
Kansas City, MO 64112
gjustis@wcllp.com
Telephone No.: (816) 701-1170

- 19. The Parties to this Decree agree to be bound by the terms of this Decree and agree not to contest its validity in any subsequent proceeding to implement or enforce its terms.
- 20. Upon approval and entry of this Decree by the Court, this Decree shall constitute a final judgment between and among the State, the Town and the Settling Defendants, and the Complaint shall be dismissed with prejudice (except that the dismissal shall be without prejudice solely as to the enforcement of this Decree and as to matters arising under the Reopener provision in Paragraph 8 of this Decree).

STATE OF NEW YORK and COMMISSIONER OF THE NEW YORK STATE DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL CONSERVATION

ERIC T. SCHNEIDERMAN
Attorney General of the State of New York

Dated: (-14-11

Todd D. Ommen

Assistant Attorney General Environmental Protection Bureau

120 Broadway

New York, NY 10271

	Party Name:
	TOWN OF CLARKSTOWN, NEW YORK
Dated;	By: Thambu Framas
	Name: Alexander J. Gromack
•	Title: Supervisor

ALLIED WASTE NORTH AMERICA, INC. FOR ITSELF AND ITS SUBSIDIARIES, INCLUDING, WITHOUT LIMITATION, AMERICAN DISPOSAL SERVICES OF NEW JERSEY, INC. AND BFI WASTE SYSTEMS OF NEW JERSEY, INC., AND INSOFAR AS IT AND ITS SUBSIDIARIES ARE ALLEGED TO BE A SUCCESSOR TO VINCENT IPPOLITO, INC. AND ROUND LAKE SANITATION CORP.

Dated: 11/22/2010

By:

Name: Tim

Title: Vice President

16

AMERTAC FOR ITSELF AND AMERTAC HOLDINGS, INC., AMERICAN TACK & HARDWARE CO., INC., AND AT&H CO., INC.

CEO

Dated: 23 NW 10

By:

Name:

Title:

AVERY DENNISON CORPORATION

Dated: Novembr 242010

Name: Timother
Title: A EAS

BARR LABORATORIES, INC.

Dated: November 19, 2010

Erella Dimentita

Name: \_

Grella Dimentolain

Title:

: Sr. Director EH43

Dated: 11/19/10

By:

Name: Deborah Griffin

chief Amangul Officer

Party Name: BECTON DICKINSON AND COMPANY

[SETTLING DEFENDANT]

Dated; December 1,2010

Name: Richard A. Curbine
Title: Assistant Secretar

Dated; 11/23/2010

BOROUGH OF RINGWOOD

Name: THEODORE TAUKUS

Title: MAYOR

Attest:

SUSAN ROHDIECK, Deputy

Borough Clerk

CHROMALLOY NEW YORK, DIV. OF CHROMALLOY GAS TURBINE CORP.

Dated: 11-23-10

By: Name:

Title:

Party Name: CLARKSTOWN CENTRAL SCHOOL DISTRICT

[SETTLING DEFENDANT]

Ву:\_\_

Name:

Title: CIARR GOUNDOR

Consolidated Rail Corporation

[SETTLING DEFENDANT]

Dated; \_\_11/29/10

Name: Jonathan M. Broder

Vice President-Corporate Development and Chief Legal Officer Title:

COSCO INDUSTRIES INC.

Dated: M/24/10

y: .

Name: \_

fregory is Jacus.

Title: U.C. Paux. Den

Case 7:11-cv-00293-KMK-JCM Document 4 Filed 03/21/11 Page 27 of 76

12/10/2010 16:19

19146311199

TARRYTOWN

PAGE 03/04

Party Name:

County Asphalt, 'Inc.

[SETTLING DEFENDANT]

Dated; \_\_12/3/10

Name: Michael Cooney Title: Authorized Agent

COUNTY OF ROCKLAND HIGHWAY DEPT.

ROCKLAND COUNTY SEWER DISTRICT NO. 1

[SETTLING DEFENDANT]

Dated; 12/1/10

By: And and Name: C. Scott Vanderhoef (

Title: County Executive

Evonik Degussa Curporation as successor to Dynamit Nobel of America Party Name:

[SETTLING DEFENDANT]

Dated; 1//23 / 10

Name: JOHN WINE K
Title: Vice President Envronment,
Health & Safety
Evenik Desussa Composition.

Document 4 Filed 03/21/11

Party Name: Fisher Scientific Company L.L.C., by its Manager and Sole Member, Fisher Scientific International Inc.

Dated: 10/15/10

By: Maura A. Spellman' Assistant Treasurer

FORD MOTOR CO.

Dated: 12/9/10

Name: Louis J. Ghilardi Assistant Secretary

Title:

Party Name: Network The. d/bla The Journal

News

[SETTLING DEFENDANT]

Dated; Nov 19 2010

Title: Secretary

[SETTLING DEFENDANT]
HOLT CONSTRUCTION CORP.

Dated; November 22, 2010

Name: Jack F. Holt

Title: CEO

INNOVATIVE PLASTICS CORPORATION

Dated: 11/22/10

3y: 7/0

Title:

Party Name: International Paper Company

[SETTLING DEFENDANT]

Dated; 12/3/10

By: // / Nota

Title: ChioR Courses

Romodication

Dated: 11 17 10

Name: J. Fletcher Creamer, Jr. Title: CEO

MARTIN MARIETTA MATERIALS, INC.

Dated: January 7, 2011

Name: Roselyn R. Bar
Title: Senior Vice President, General

Counsel and Corporate Secretary

METAL IMPROVEMENT COMPANY, LLC (F/K/A METAL IMPROVEMENT COMPANY,

INC.)

Dated: November 17, 2010

By:

Mame: James Ruscin Title: Senior Vice President

MOMENTIVE SPECIALTY CHEMICALS INC. (f/k/a Borden Chemicals, Inc.)

Dated: 11/30/2010

Name: C RICHARD SPRINGER

Title: ULE PROJEGNT CHS - AMORICAS

NANUET, UNION FREE SCHOOL DISTRICT

Dated: 12/2/2010

Title: School

Filed 03/21/11 Page 41 of 76 Case 7:11-cv-00293-KMK-JCM Document 4

Party Name:

NESTLE WATERS NORTH AMERICA INC.

Dated: November 22, 2010

Ву: Name: Title:

NOVARTIS CORPORATION (F/K/A CIBA-GEIGY CORPORATION) ON BEHALF OF ITSELF, ITS PREDECESSORS AND ITS PAST AND CURRENT AFFILIATES, INCLUDING BUT NOT LIMITED TO SANDOZ PHARMACUETICALS CORPORATION, SANDOZ CHEMICALS CORPORATION, CLARIANT CORPORATION, CIBA CORPORATION, GEIGY CHEMICAL CORPORATION, SYNGENTA CROP PROTECTION, INC. AND NOVARTIS PHARMACUTICALS CORPORATION

Dated:	By:	<u> </u>		
	•	Name:	Robert Pelzer	
		Title:	President and Head of	Legal Affair

NYACK HOSPITAL [a Settling Defendant]

Dated: November 18, 2010

Name: David Freed Title: President & CEO

Dated: 12 6 10

NYACK UNION FREE SCHOOL DISTRICT

Michael P. Lagana President, BOE-Nyack

Party Name: ORANGE & ROCKLAND WHITES, INC.

SETTLING DEFENDANT

Dated; 11/24/2010

Name: Elizabeth D. Moore

Title: General Counsel

PEARL RIVER SCHOOL DISTRICT

Dated: 11/30/10

Namer Frank V. Aurienma

Title:

RECEIVED 11/24/2010 11:20 7324494483

PLAST-CLAD METAL

3095

GIORDANO HALLERAN

11-24-2010 11:22:56 a.m.

2 /2

Party Name:

PLASTI-CLAD METAL PRODUCTS, INC.

PEARSON EDUCATION, INC. (F/K/A PRENTICE HALL, INC.)

Dated: 1130/10

By: R Cottle
Name: George R. Costello

Pfizer Inc. for itself and its subsidiaries Including, without limitation, Wyeth Holdings Corporation acting through Wyeth Pharmaceuticals (Lederle Laboratories)

Dated: November 24 2010

By:

Name: Michael G. Mahoney Title: Assibut General Course

PULSAFEEDER, INC.

Dated: 11/22/10

Name: Rick KENNED-T

Title: OUTSIDE COUNTY

RAMAPO CENTRAL SCHOOL DISTRICT

01/2010

By: Name:

ame: Robert 1

itle: Superintendent of

SANITARY WASTE CARRIERS, INC.

Vame: Frank

Title: Serior Vice Resident

SEARS, ROEBUCK AND CO.

Name: Diana Han
Title: Pasis Hant General Counsel,

SOUTH ORANGETOWN CENTRAL SCHOOL

DISTRICT

Dated: 11-30 -16

Title: Superintendent

Party Name: Suburban Carting Corp.

[SETTLING DEFENDANT]

y: The Mile
Name: Thomas Mile

Name: Thomas Mulo
Title: Indemnitor \*

\* Thomas Milo, pursuant to Section 8(a) i) of a Settlement Agreement dated Leve, 2005, as amended, agreed to tender a defense and indemnity to Suburban Certing Corp. and has executed this Consent. Decrese on its behalf in his Capacity as Indemnitor.

THALLE CONSTRUCTION CO.

Dated: \_\_//-23-/0

By: William May
Title: Treasurer

, ,	Party Name:	
	TOWN OF GREENBURGH, NEW YORK	
Dated:	By:	
	Name: Paul Feiner Title: Supervicor Town of Greent	(_
•	Title: Suzervicor Town of Green't	, we will

•	Party Name:
	TOWN OF ORANGETOWN, NEW YORK
Dated:	By: July luc
	PAUL G. WHALEN, Supervisor
	\

Filed 03/21/11

Party Name: Uneeda Futerprizes, Inc.

[SETTLING DEFENDANT]

Dated; Nov. 18, 2010

Name: Bruse Fuchs
Title: President

Party Name: United Water New Jersey One.

[SETTLING DEFENDANT]

Dated; December 13,2010

y: What a De

Title: Vice Plesident, General Coursel and

Secretary

Party Name: United WATER New YORK INC. [SETTLING DEFENDANT]

Dated; Decomber 13,20/0 By: Michael

Name: Michael J. POINTIN Title: Via Plesident and General Manag

Dated: Nov. 29/10.

VALE INCO AMERICAS INC

Name: 6

Name: <u>Car I D</u> Title: <u>Secretor</u> Case 7:11-cv-00293-KMK-JCM Document 4 Filed 03/21/11 Page 63 of 76

Party Name:

[SETTLING DEFENDANT]

Name:

Title: ¿

VILLAGE OF ARDSLEY, NEW YORK

V: Doland Hor

Fitle: PARKING VILLES DETENENS

Filed 03/21/11 Case 7:11-cv-00293-KMK-JCM Document 4 Page 65 of 76

Party Name:

VILLAGE OF DOBBS FERRY, NEW YORK

Dated: 11/30/10

Darius P. Chafizadeli Name: Title:

VILLAGE OF ELMSFORD, NEW YORK

Dated: November 17, 2010

Name: Robert Williams

Title: Mayor

VILLAGE OF HASTINGS-ON-HUDSON, NEW YORK

Dated: 11-19-10

By: Name: MARIANNE STECICH

VILLAGE OF IRVINGTON, NEW YORK

Dated: 11-19-10

Title: VILLAGE ATTORNEY

VOLKSWAGEN GROUP OF AMERICA, INC.

Dated: 11 24 10

Name: ANTHONY M. Cooke

Name: ANTHONY M. Cooke

Product and Regulatory Matters

WASTE MANAGEMENT OF NEW YORK,

LLC AND MARANGI BROS., INC.

Dated: December 2, 2010

Name: Stanhen T. Toy

Title: Group Director-CSMG

WIKOFF COLOR CORP.

Dated: November 19, 2010

Name M B Rorie

Title: Vice President - Finance

ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED the 2 15th day of Mich

201

## APPENDIX A – SETTLING DEFENDANTS SUBJECT TO REOPENER PROVISION

Allied Waste North America, Inc. for itself and its subsidiaries, including, without limitation, American Disposal Services of New Jersey, Inc. and BFI Waste Systems of New Jersey, Inc., and insofar as it and its subsidiaries are alleged to be a successor to Vincent Ippolito, Inc. and Round Lake Sanitation Corp.

Barr Laboratories, Inc.

Chromalloy New York, Division of Chromalloy Gas Turbine Corporation

Clarkstown Central School District

County Asphalt, Inc.

County of Rockland Highway Department

Evonik Degussa Corporation as successor to Dynamit Nobel of America

Fisher Scientific Company LLC

Ford Motor Company

Gannett Satellite Information Network, Inc., d/b/a The Journal News

International Paper Company

Metal Improvement Company, LLC (f/k/a Metal Improvement Company, Inc.)

Momentive Specialty Chemicals, Inc. (f/k/a Borden Chemical, Inc.)

Nyack Hospital

Orange and Rockland Utilities, Inc.

Pfizer Inc. for itself and its subsidiaries including, without limitation, Wyeth Holding Corporation acting through Wyeth Pharmaceuticals (Lederle Laboratories)

Rockland County Sewer District No. 1

Sanitary Waste Carriers, Inc.

Town of Orangetown, New York

United Water New Jersey Inc.

United Water New York Inc.

Waste Management of New York, LLC and Marangi Bros., Inc.

Wikoff Color Corporation

## APPENDIX B - SETTLING DEFENDANTS NOT SUBJECT TO REOPENER **PROVISIONS**

AmerTac for itself and AmerTac Holdings, Inc., American Tack & Hardware Co., Inc. and AT&H Co., Inc.

Avery Dennison Corporation

Becton, Dickinson and Company

Borough of Ringwood, New Jersey

Consolidated Rail Corporation

Cosco Industries Inc.

Holt Construction Corporation

Innovative Plastics Corporation

J. Fletcher Creamer & Son, Inc.

Martin Marietta Materials, Inc.

Nanuet Union Free School District

Nestle Waters North America Inc.

Novartis Corporation (f/k/a Ciba-Geigy Corporation)

Nyack Union Free School District

Pearl River School District

Plasti-Clad Metal Products, Inc.

Pearson Education, Inc. (f/k/a Prentice Hall, Inc.)

Pulsafeeder, Inc.

Ramapo Central School District

Sears, Roebuck and Co.

South Orangetown Central School District

Suburban Carting Corp.

Thalle Construction Co.

Town of Greenburgh, New York

Uneeda Enterprizes, Inc.

Vale Inco Americas Inc.

Verizon New York Inc.

Village of Ardsley, New York

Village of Dobbs Ferry, New York

Village of Elmsford, New York

Village of Hastings-on-Hudson, New York

Village of Irvington, New York

Volkswagen Group of America, Inc.